

An Analysis of Pakistan's Peacebuilding Model in Former FATA

Sana Noor and Mamoona Mahmood

Sana is a Freelance Researcher and Secretary with OIC-Pakistan desk, sananoor83@gmail.com

Mamoona is former student of Security Studies at Quaid-e-Azam University, Islamabad,
mamoonaamahmood2@gmail.com

Since its independence Pakistan has been struggling to maintain democracy, which has negatively affected the capacity of state to ensure the rights of its citizen. The problem was worse in the region of Former FATA: area that was disconnected from centre and state had little jurisdiction over it. In the absence of writ of state and negligence towards civil and political rights of people in the Former FATA, extremist ideology easily paved its way in the society. Former FATA became the epicenter of terrorist activities which engulfed whole Pakistan. The management of this type of conflict was a different kind of challenge for Pakistan. As Pakistan army was trained for traditional warfare and to counter violent extremism required different kind of approach and strategy. In order to curb the conflict, Pakistan army underwent transformation and adopted counter terrorism techniques which largely focused on maintaining security and building peace. Peacebuilding in the Former FATA has been a novel phenomenon for state of Pakistan because it had to formulate a policy of integration and implement it. The peace building in the Former FATA can be defined as merger, reintegration and, mainstreaming of FATA. This can be better understood under the banner of domestic intervention, all-encompassing democracy and realization of collective interests.

Domestic Intervention

The post-conflict peacebuilding has been largely understood and debated in the context of interventionist phenomena operated by external actors or more precisely a phenomenon carried out by westerner powers. Post-conflict peacebuilding is a heterogeneous concept that has a tendency to produce debate. Many have raised doubts about the ideological support of post-conflict peacebuilding, which they state is being modified by Western states to legitimize another type of interventionism or to advance the post 9/11 plan of stabilization.¹ On another level the systems applied by international organizations are regularly reprimanded for not giving sufficient thought to real factors and the genuine needs of the

¹ O. Richmond, "UN Peace Operations and the Dilemmas of Peace building Consensus," *International Peacekeeping* 11, no. 1 (2004): 83-101.

concerned populaces.² On the other hand development in post conflict societies is relied on foreign assistance and this assistance means “rebuilding the institutions and infrastructures of nations torn by civil war and strife; building bonds of peaceful mutual benefit among nations formerly at war”.³ The peacebuilding model in the former FATA stands in sheer contrast with this debate because there was no western power involved; it was as a pure indigenous effort. According to established concepts in peacebuilding foreign intervention starts when state has collapsed, none of this happened in FATA as state of Pakistan was there to secure and safeguard the region of FATA. It was only a matter of integration which was achieved in 2018 and tribal areas became part of Khyber Pakhtun Khawa.

Steps to Inclusive Democracy

OECD has asserted the importance of “open and inclusive government”, towards which many countries have made progress.⁴In this assertive manual, public sector organizations are expected to live up to the ideal of democratic principles and to advance civic results, which they do in many ways. They allow their oversight by a legislative assembly, ensure that holders of public offices are accountable for the exercise of power, provide for transparency, ensure access to information, and encourage participation in the process of policy making to ensure ample buy-ins and strong hold up for initiatives driven by government.⁵ Fragile government and socially disorganized population come together to advance a political controlling system that inevitably process discriminatory societal relationships and politics of self-interests that functions against the welfare of the underprivileged and destitute.⁶ In comparison to the widely accepted and acknowledged definitions of political rights, the former FATA presents a highly different scenario. The political development in the former FATA stands in a sheer contrast with the other parts of the country. The FATA was governed by Frontier Crimes Regulation, implemented by Britishers, which was obviated of guarding rights of people. Frontier Crimes Regulation conferred magisterial powers on Political Agent which made him the supreme authority and FCR also spurned the right to approach a lawyer and to appeal

² J. Chopra and T. Hohe, ‘Participatory Peace building’, in *Building Sustainable Peace*, eds. T Keating and A Knight (Tokyo: United Nations, 2004), 241-62.

³ Ibid. para, 15.

⁴ Draft Policy Framework on Sound Public Governance, <https://www.oecd.org/governance/policy-framework-on-sound-public-governance/chapter-1-oecd-draft-policy-framework-on-sound-public-governance.pdf>, 18-19, Accessed 23rd January 2020.

⁵Jocelyn Bourgon, 'The history and Future of Nation-building? Building Capacity for Public Results', *International Review of Administrative Sciences* 76, no. 2 (2010):.197-200.

⁶ Robert O Keohane, 'Governance in a Partially Globalized World', *American Political Science Review* 95, no. 1 (2001): 1-13.

in court against the decision of Jirga.⁷ The elected democratic governments in Pakistan were not able to look after the fundamental political rights of people of the former FATA. Their free will of expression, affiliation and involvement in political matters was clamped down. The dread of putting behind the bars and loosing life suppressed their will of expressing openly. Consequently, due to these marginalization actions of the political elites across the whole tribal region, communicating opinions and indicating deficiencies in the demonstrations of the political elites was equal to burrowing graves for the people who dared to take such steps. With zero privilege to freedom of expression, people of the former FATA remained vulnerable to exploitation.⁸ In order to achieve the desired results of peace building it is necessary to use the dynamic involvement of citizens, value investors or revolutionized actors of change.⁹

The reform package announced for the former FATA addresses some of the postulates of inclusive democracy. The creation of FATA secretariat in 2002, which later became civil secretariat (2006), was an important decision because it made the implementation of different development projects easier.¹⁰ In 2000 Agency Council was established which was envisioned as the epitome of local representation. The agenda and mission of the council was very inspirational. However what was envisaged for the council never materialized. The administration of the council was in the hand of Political Agent who nominated and elected the members. Again this provided an absolute control of Political Agent over council and in 2007 the council's term expired, without any proclamation of its future activities.¹¹ The state of Pakistan in 2013 extended the exarchate of federal ombudsman to FATA. This paved the way for regional accountability which was never imagined in FATA before. The FATA residents became entitled to contact the ombudsman against the FATA Secretariat and its subsidiary institutions.¹² The responsibility of social or political inclusiveness is linked with the behavior of elites because elites need to develop and implement the policy that enhances the cohesive structure of society.¹³ That is why, the traditional system

⁷ Syed Akhtar Ali Shah, Saima Perveen, Jehanzeb Khalil, 'Governance Challenges in Mainstreaming of Federally Administrated Tribal Areas into Khyber Pakhtunkhawa', *FWU Journal of Social Sciences* 13, no.1 (2019):136

⁸ Ibid.

⁹ Jocelyn Bourgon, 'The History and Future of Nation Building? Building Capacity for Public Results', *International Review of Administrative Sciences* 76. No. 2 (2010):199.

¹⁰ Ibid. 46

¹¹ Umbreen Javed, *Pakistan Fights Extremism and Terrorism*, (Lahore: Vanguard Books, 2013): 45.

¹² <https://fatareforms.org/>, Accessed 19th February 2020.

¹³ Easterly, William, Jozef Ritzen, and Michael Woolcock, 'Social cohesion, Institutions, and Growth', *Economics and Politics* 18, no. 2 (2006): 103-105.

of justice, Qaumi Jirga (comprised of tribal elders) has not been abolished and it has been empowered and given voice in the matters related to betterment of people of the former FATA.

Realization of Collective Interests

North Atlantic Treaty Organization abides by the terms 'stabilization' and 'peace support' in line with its military mandate, while the European Union uses the meaning 'civilian crisis management' within the framework of its European Security and Defense Policy. Among the many other regional organizations involved in this sphere, the African Union explains peace building and development, 'a comprehensive set of measures that seek to: address the needs of countries emerging from conflict, including the needs of affected population; prevent escalation of disputes; avoid relapse into violence; address the root causes of conflict; and consolidate sustainable peace.¹⁴ These different definitions broadly highlight the importance of collective interests of societies emerging out of conflict. Collective and shared interests are those interests that are higher than any race, breed and origin. It has nothing to do with the religion and belief system. They are solely based on humanitarian beneficial traits that should be adopted in order to secure better good of humanity. These interests include: access to education, health and food, peace and security, environmental protection and social inclusion. The fulfillment of public demands is a mandatory requisite for state legitimacy. States that pay attention to public rights sustain a vast and effective outreach to its population.¹⁵

Some of the initiatives undertaken by Pakistan includes: in the year 2019 Khyber Pakhtun Khawa government released 4.4 billion to be used on damaged schools, healthcare centers, water facilities and irrigation channels.¹⁶ Cadet colleges have been established with the collaboration of military and civil government. The decision was sanctioned by the erstwhile Yusuf Raza Gillani in 2010 and Cadet College Wana was established in 2011.¹⁷ The role of Pakistan army can also be not denied in developing peace in former FATA through a varied range of activities. A number of impactful community oriented development projects by army includes rebuilding of roads, schemes of clean water supply and sewerage.

¹⁴ African Union, *Report on the Elaboration of a Framework Document on Post Conflict Reconstruction and Development*, 2006, <https://archives.au.int/handle/123456789/4258>, Accessed 4th June 2020.

¹⁵ Syed Akhtar Ali Shah, Saima Perveen, Jehanzeb Khalil, 'Governance Challenges in Mainstreaming of Federally Administrated Tribal Areas into Khyber Pakhtunkhawa', *FWU Journal of Social Sciences* 13, no.1 (2019): 135.

¹⁶ <https://www.dawn.com/news/1481803/rs44bn-released-for-reconstruction-schemes-in-former-fata>, accessed 17th June 2020.

¹⁷ Hamid Khan Wazir, 'Army's Education Campaign in FATA Harbinger of Change', *Pakistan Today*, Last updated 22 May, 2018, <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2018/05/22/armys-education-campaign-in-fata-harbinger-of-change/>, Accessed 17 June 2020.

In addition to that, army officials collected the data of teachers, students and doctors by visiting schools, colleges and health care centers. This data was used to re-establish the destroyed infrastructure and to designate staff according to the regional requirements. In the initial days of post-conflict reconstruction army's medical unit provided free medical facility to not only who wounded in war but to civil population as well.¹⁸ Army has also organized a sport festival titled "FATA Peace Games".¹⁹ The games included in this festival were Badminton, Hockey, Table Tennis, Football, Athletics, Basketball, and Tug of War. Talent search among the young population of FATA has also been on the agenda of peacebuilding. To serve the purpose cricket trials for youth of FATA were carried out at Younis Khan Cricket Ground, Miran Shah. It was a joint effort of Pakistan Cricket Board (PCB) and Pakistan army for the aspirant cricketers in North Waziristan Agency. More than 12000 youth were enrolled in training centers of the region. Major General Asif Ghafoor, spokesperson of Inter Services Public Relation, regarded such practices as an indicator of peace and normalcy.²⁰

Conclusion

In the presence of western narrative of peace building, the former FATA presents a new dimension to peace building discourse. As it is a domestic intervention rather than foreign intervention. Peacebuilding in the former FATA has been polymorphous and also multi dimensional in terms of building trust of people in the writ of state and, with already weak economy managing developmental plans for former FATA. It has been multi-leveled in terms of efforts put forward by Pakistan army and civil administration of KP government. Pakistani model of peace building can be divided into two phases. The first phase is comprised of maintaining peace and order. It was mainly focused on the security sector reforms. The second phase is marked with the merger of FATA with KP. Although merger is attributed as a major step towards reintegration of FATA, still the true essence of peacebuilding has not been achieved. The political inclusivity is incomplete as women representation in political matters is yet to be given a voice. Though the collective rights of citizens have been materialized and they have been provided with health care and education; roads have been built; key infrastructure has been constructed, there is a lot more work to do. State should devise plans and policies to utilize the local resources to empower population. Former FATA is rich agro-based and mineral based economy. Licensing and training for mining should be given to young

¹⁸ Maemuna Sadaf, 'Role of Pakistan Army in FATA', Kashmir Watch, March 17, 2018,

<https://kashmirwatch.com/role-of-pakistan-army-in-fata/#:~:text=Writing%20more%2C%20Pakistan%20Army%20is,and%20other%20community%20welfare%20schemes>. Accessed 16th June 2020.

¹⁹ Ibid.

²⁰ Ibid.

people along with that they should be provided with loans to work on live stock, dairy and farming. Such practices will help lift poverty from the region and chances of exploitation for any future anti state activities will be diminished.